# **Isotopic fractionation of boron in growing corals and its palaeoenvironmental implication**

# Y. K. Xiao<sup>1,2,\*</sup>, P. V. Shirodkar<sup>3</sup>, C. G. Zhang<sup>2</sup>, H. Z. Wei<sup>2</sup>, W. G. Liu<sup>1</sup> and W. J. Zhou<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>State Key Laboratory of Loess and Quaternary Geology, Institute of Earth Environment, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Xi'an, Shaanxi 710075, China

<sup>2</sup>Qinghai Institute of Salt Lakes, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Xining, QH 810008, China <sup>3</sup>National Institute of Oceanography, Dona Paula, Goa 403 004, India

Isotopic compositions of boron ( $d^{11}B_c$  value) and elemental concentrations of B, Ca, Mg, Fe and Al in growing corals from Sanya Bay, China and Kavaratti Lagoon, India along with **d**<sup>11</sup>B<sub>sw</sub> values and pH values of the coexisting sea water have been measured in this study using TIMS. The  $d^{11}B_c$  values of growing corals behave inconsistently and are not related to the concentrations of Fe and Al in corals. The higher  $d^{1}B_{c}$ values of corals imply additional amount of trigonal species of boron to be incorporated into corals. Based on the measured **d**<sup>11</sup>B values of growing corals and coexisting sea water as well as the pH of co-existing sea water, a new isotopic fractionation factor  $a_{43}$  between two boron species,  $B(OH)_4^-$  and  $B(OH)_3$ , has been measured to be 0.980, consistent with the well accepted  $a_{43}$ of 0.981 established by earlier workers.

The significance of  $\mathbf{a}_{43}$  value established by recalculating the sea water pH considering the published  $\mathbf{d}^{11}$ B values of marine carbonates and using the reported  $\mathbf{a}_{43}$  values of 0.968, 0.981, 0.984 and one  $\mathbf{a}_{43}$  of 0.980 observed in this study, gave the average pH values of sea water to be 8.85, 8.17, 7.76 and 8.22 respectively. This indicates the closeness of  $\mathbf{a}_{43}$  value of 0.980 with that of the well-accepted reported  $\mathbf{a}_{43}$  of 0.981 as the recalculated pH values of sea water obtained using these are nearly the same. The  $\mathbf{a}_{43}$  value of 0.980 observed in this study can therefore be considered an acceptable value for reconstructing the past sea water pH values.

**Keywords:** Boron, coral, isotopic compositions, isotopic fractionation, sea water.

THE use of boron isotopes in marine biogenic carbonate for the reconstruction of palaeo-pH of sea water relies on a large isotopic fractionation between the two aqueous species,  $B(OH)_3$  and  $B(OH)_4^-$  of boron<sup>1-4</sup>. Their relative abundance in sea water is strongly pH-dependent. Isotopic fractionation of boron between  $B(OH)_3$  and  $B(OH)_4^-$  occurs due to different reduced partition function ratios for the two molecular species, resulting in <sup>10</sup>B enrichment in the  $B(OH)_4^-$ . Boron uptake in marine biogenic carbonate takes place by  $B(OH)_4^-$  incorporation, with little or no boron isotopic fractionation<sup>5</sup>, so the  $d^{1}B$  value in marine biogenic carbonate potentially records the  $d^{1}B$  value of  $B(OH)_4^-$  of sea water, i.e. the pH of sea water. The first isotopic fractionation factor  $\boldsymbol{a}_{43}$  of 0.981 between B(OH)<sub>4</sub><sup>-</sup> and B(OH)<sub>3</sub> was determined<sup>6</sup> based on both theoretical partition function calculations and boron adsorption experiments on ion exchange resin. Thereafter, a lower  $a_{43}$ of 0.968 was determined<sup>7</sup> based on adsorption experiments of boron onto marine clays. Moreover, Hemming et al.<sup>8</sup> calculated a fractionation factor of 0.984 and a new isotopic fractionation factor of 0.976 was subsequently given by Lécuyer et al.<sup>9</sup> by deriving an isotopic fractionation curve  $(\mathbf{a}_{\text{calcite sea water}} = 0.023X_{[B(\text{OH})_4]} + 0.976)$  between brachiopod calcite and sea water. The  $\boldsymbol{a}_{calcite sea water} = 0.976$  when  $X_{[B(OH)_4]}$  equates to 0 and **a**<sub>calcite sea water</sub> of 0.976 corresponds to isotopic fractionation between  $B(OH)_4^-$  and  $B(OH)_3$ . The isotopic fractionation factor  $a_{43}$  is an extremely important parameter in the calculation of palaeo-pH values of sea water for studying the oceanic palaeoenvironments and are based on the isotopic composition of boron  $(\mathbf{d}^{1}\mathbf{B}_{c})$  in marine biogenic carbonates. Using these  $a_{43}$  values, Sanyal *et al.*<sup>10</sup> estimated that the deep Atlantic and Pacific Oceans had a pH  $0.3 \pm 0.1$  units higher during the last Glaciation. Pearson and Palmer<sup>11</sup> found that the pH was significantly lower during early Palaeogene than in the Neogene period. Spivack et al.12 reported that the surface ocean pH, about 21 Myr ago was only  $7.4 \pm 0.2$ , which then increased to  $8.2 \pm 0.2$  around 7.5 Myr ago, by using the lower isotopic fractionation factor  $a_{43}$  of 0.968.

Here, we present results of isotopic fractionation observed between  $B(OH)_4^-$  and  $B(OH)_3$  using the measured  $d^{1}B$  of sea water and growing corals, as well as the pH of coexisting sea water. The significance of the new isotopic fractionation factor  $a_{43}$  has been evaluated for its suitability of use in reconstructing the paleo-pH of the oceans.

### Materials and methods

### Description of samples

All corals used in this study are growing corals. Of these, ten corals (SYC-1–10) pertained to seven different species:

<sup>\*</sup>For correspondence. (e-mail: xiaoyk@isl.ac.cn)

Sample	Location	Sampling date	Species of coral	
SYSW (sea water) <sup>†</sup>	Sanya Bay, Hainan Prov., China	7 October 2001	_	
SYC-1 (coral)			Acropora pulchra	
SYC-2 (coral)			Acropora prostrata	
SYC-3 (coral)			Acropora corymbosa	
SYC-4 (coral)			Acropora prostrata	
SYC-5 (coral)			Stylophora pistillata	
SYC-6 (coral)			Pocillopora brevicornis lamarck	
SYC-7 (coral)			Pocillopora danae verril	
SYC-8 (coral)			Pocillopora danae verril	
SYC-9 (coral)			Montipora ramosa bernard	
SYC-10 (coral)			Acropora pulchra	
SSC-1 (coral)	Southern China Sea		Poritidae	
SSC-2 (coral)			Poritidae	
SKLC (coral)	Southern Kavaratti lagoon	31 January 2001	Porites leutea	
CKLC (coral)	Central Kavaratti lagoon	•	P. leutea	
NKLC (coral)	Northern Kavaratti lagoon		P. leutea	

 Table 1.
 Locations and species of corals studied

<sup>†</sup>pH value and temperature of sea water are 8.12 and 28.6°C respectively.

2 Acropora pulchra, 2 Acropora prostrata, 1 Acropora corymbosa, 1 Stylophora pistillata, 1 Pocillopora brevicornis lamarck, 2 Pocillopora danae verril and 1 Montipora ramosa bernard, and the coexisting sea water (SYSW) from Sanya Bay, Hainan, China and were collected during 7 October 2001. The sampling areas are only a few kilometres from each sampling site, so the coexisting sea water for every coral is nearly the same. The pH and temperature of sea water were measured immediately after sample collection. Besides, two corals (SSC-1, 2) from Southern China Sea, with no coexisting sea water were provided by South China Institute of Oceanology, Chinese Academy of Sciences and three corals (SKLC, CKLC, NKLC) from Kavaratti lagoon (72°38'E, 10°33'N) in Lakshadweep Islands of the Arabian Sea, collected on 31 January, 2001 were provided by NIO, Goa. All these corals have not been studied before. The sample data including sampling date, locations, species of corals and the pH of sea water are given in Table 1.

### Sample preparation and analyses

The fine branches of corals were cut and approximately 5 g of each cut coral was crushed in an agate mortar and washed with double-distilled water to remove soluble salts. Then it was dipped in 30% hydrogen peroxide solution and kept overnight to remove organic matter from the surface. After discarding the hydrogen peroxide solution, coral samples were dried under an infrared lamp at 60°C. The dried coral samples were powdered into 100–200 mesh and washed few times with a warm 30% hydrogen peroxide and then low-boron water with 0.4 ng B/ml of boron concentration to remove organic matter. About 500 mg of each cleaned coral powder was dissolved in just enough 1.0 M high-purity HCl for complete dissolution. The pH of the resulting solution was adjusted to 6 using

0.5 M NaOH and sample solutions were centrifuged for 1 h. Almost all sample solutions were clear and the supernatant was ready for chemical separation of boron.

Boron was isolated from solution in two chromatographic steps using Amberlite IRA 743 boron-specific resin<sup>13</sup> and a mixed resin of cation-exchanger ( $H^+$  form) and anion-exchanger (ion-exchanger II, HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> form)<sup>14</sup>. Sample solutions were first loaded onto a column with 0.4 cm diameter. The column was filled with 0.25 ml of Amberlite 743 boron-specific resin (~80 mesh) preconditioned by 10 ml of 2 M HCl, 20 ml of H<sub>2</sub>O and 10 ml of 3 M NH<sub>4</sub>OH. The column was then rinsed sequentially by 10 ml of high purity water, 10 ml of 2M NH<sub>4</sub>OH and 10 ml of high-purity water. The boron absorbed by the resin was eluted by 5 ml of 0.1 M HCl at 75°C. After cooling the elution of 0.1 M HCl, it was loaded into the second column filled with a mixed resin of 2 ml cationexchange resin  $(H^+ \text{ form})$  and 2 ml anion-exchange resin (ion-exchanger II,  $HCO_3^-$  form). The boron here was eluted by 10 ml of low-boron water. After appropriate mannitol and Cs<sub>2</sub>CO<sub>3</sub> additions, the eluate was evaporated in a clean oven at 60°C to produce a boron solution with boron concentration of around 1  $\mu$ g B/ $\mu$ l.

The boron isotopic compositions of samples were measured based on the measurement of  $Cs_2BO_2^+$  with a graphite loading using a single magnetic sector thermal ionization mass spectrometer<sup>15</sup>, VG 354. The sample solution was first loaded onto a flat degassed Ta filament coated by 2.5 µl graphite slurry. Data were collected by switching magnetically between the masses 308 ( $^{133}Cs_2^{10}B^{16}O_2^+$ ) and 309 ( $^{133}Cs_2^{11}B^{16}O_2^+$ ) and the intensity ratio of the ion beams at masses 308 and 309 ( $R_{309/308}$ ) was calculated. The  $^{11}B/^{10}B$  ratio was calculated as  $R_{309/308}$ –0.00078. The isotopic composition of boron was expressed as **d** <sup>1</sup>B value relative to NIST SRM 951 H<sub>3</sub>BO<sub>3</sub> according to the following formula:

$$\mathbf{d}^{1}B \ (\%) = [({}^{11}B/{}^{10}B)_{\text{sample}}/({}^{11}B/{}^{10}B)_{\text{NIST 951}} - 1] \times 1000,$$
(1)

where the standard material is NIST SRM 951. The measured  ${}^{11}\text{B}/{}^{10}\text{B}$  value of NIST SRM 951 was 4.05048 (SD)  $\pm 0.00034$  (2 $s_m$ , n = 6) with an analytical uncertainty of 0.1‰. The analytical uncertainties of boron isotopes for most of samples are lower than 0.5‰.

Boron concentration was determined by the azomethine-H spectrophotometric method<sup>16</sup> with a reproducibility of 2%. The chemical compositions were measured using conventional methods.

#### **Results and discussion**

### Boron isotopic compositions and chemical compositions of growing corals

The  $d^{11}B$  values and chemical constituents measured in growing corals and sea water are presented in Table 2. The  $d^{11}B_c$  values of corals are shown in Figure 1. For all samples, repetitive analyses have been done. The  $d^{11}B_c$  values show that the corals can be divided into two groups. In group I, nine corals have lower  $d^{11}B_c$  values ranging from 22.5 to 25.5‰, with an average of 23.3 ± 1.1‰ and are consistent with those of (a) 22.1 ± 3‰ reported by Hemming and Hanson<sup>5</sup>; (b) 23.3 to 25.5‰ reported by Gaillardet and Allègre<sup>17</sup>; (c) 22.7 to 24.8‰ reported by Liu *et al.*<sup>18</sup> and (d) 25.6 and 25.7‰ reported by Lécuyer *et al.*<sup>9</sup>. In group II, three corals have higher  $d^{11}B_c$  values ranging from 28.3 to 29.0‰, with an average of 28.6‰ and are consistent with those reported by Vengosh *et al.*<sup>19</sup>, i.e. from 26.7 to 31.9‰. The boron isotopic composition of sea water ( $d^{11}B_{sw}$ ) in Sanya Bay has been found to be 40.5‰.

The measured boron concentrations of growing corals range from 50.2 to 117.5  $\mu$ g B/g with an average of 70.5  $\mu$ g B/g. The reported boron concentrations of corals are from 49 to 58 ppm<sup>17</sup>, 58.7 to 79.7 ppm<sup>18</sup> and from 43 to 68 ppm<sup>19</sup>. The average value of 70.5  $\mu$ g B/g obtained in this study is comparable with the reported values.

The measured concentrations of Ca, Mg, Fe and Al in growing corals are also listed in Table 2. Ca is a major constituent of coral and exists as CaCO<sub>3</sub>. The abundance of CaCO<sub>3</sub> in coral signifies its purity. The measured abundances of CaCO<sub>3</sub> in corals range from 48 to 103.9% with an average value of  $87.0 \pm 12.0\%$ , suggesting that the whole coral is not composed of pure CaCO<sub>3</sub>. The measured CaCO<sub>3</sub> abundance of 103.9% was, perhaps, caused by analytical error. The concentration of Mg, Fe and Al in corals ranges from 0.37 to 3.90 mg/g with an average of  $1.37 \pm 0.80$  mg Mg/g, 35.2 to  $165.2 \ \mu g/g$  with an average value of  $18.7 \pm 7.2 \ \mu g$  Al/g respectively. No relationship between  $d^{1}B_{c}$  values and element concentrations is observed.

The  $d^{1}B$  values in growing corals of seven different species from Sanya Bay show a wide variation from 22.5 to 29.0‰ and apparently indicate a relationship between  $d^{1}B_{c}$  values and coral species. The species Acropora corymbosa (SYC-3), Stylophora pistillata (SYC-5) and Pocil*lopora brevicornis lamarck* (SYC-6) show higher **d**<sup>1</sup>B values of 28.3, 29.0 and 28.4% respectively, compared to others giving an average  $d^{1}B$  of 23.3‰. Corals of the same species growing at different places in Sanya Bay show nearly the same  $d^{1}B$  values (e.g. SYC-1 and 10 show **d**<sup>1</sup>B of 22.5 and 23.5‰ respectively; SYC-2 and 4 give  $d^{1}B$  of 22.5 and 22.9% respectively, while SYC-7 and 8 give  $\mathbf{d}^{1}$ B of 23.3 and 22.7‰ respectively). The  $\mathbf{d}^{1}$ B values of two Poritidae corals are the same (25.2 and 25.4‰). These results therefore discard the fact that the difference in  $d^{1}B$  values in various species of coral arises from isotopic determination error and indicate that the difference in  $d^{1}B$  values in various species of coral actually present.

### Calculation of isotopic fractionation factor ( $\mathbf{a}_{43}$ ) between $B(OH)_4^-$ and $B(OH)_3$

Various isotopic fractionation factors ( $a_{43}$ ) of 0.981, 0.968, 0.984 and 0.976 have been reported by different workers using various experimental methods as stated earlier<sup>6–9</sup>. The new isotopic fractionation factor  $a_{43}$  of 0.980 observed in this study has been confirmed based on the  $d^{11}B_c$  values of growing corals,  $d^{11}B_{sw}$  value of coexisting sea water and the pH of sea water in Sanya Bay. Figure 2 shows a plot of  $d^{11}B_4$  (i.e.  $d^{11}B_c$  vs isotopic fractionation factor  $a_{43}$ ), and  $a_{43}$  between two boron species ranging from 0.95 to 1.  $d^{11}B_4$  is calculated as follows:



Figure 1. Isotopic compositions of boron in growing corals from Sanya Bay and Southern China Sea. (SYC-1, 10, Acropora pulchra; SYC-2, 4, Acropora prostrata; SYC-7, 8, Pocillopora danae verril; SYC-11, 12, Poritidae; SYC-9, Montipora ramosa bernard; SYC-3, Acropora corymbosa; SYC-6, Pcillopora brevicornis lamarck; SYC-5, Stylophora pistillata).

CURRENT SCIENCE, VOL. 90, NO. 3, 10 FEBRUARY 2006

Table 2.         Chemical composition and isotopic composition of boron in coral and coexisting sea water												
No.	Ca (mg/g)	CaCO <sub>3</sub> (%)	Mg (mg/g)	Fe (µg/g)	Al (µg/g)	B (µg/g)	<b>d</b> <sup>1</sup> B ± 2 <b>s</b> (‰)	<ul> <li><b>a</b><sub>cs</sub> between</li> <li>coral and</li> <li>sea water (2<b>s</b>)</li> </ul>	Calculated $\mathbf{a}_{43}$ between $B_4$ and $B_3$	Calculated pH		
1						4.61	$40.5 \pm 0.6 \ (4)^{+}$	_				
2	354.0	88.5	0.82	41.6	10.8	72.5	$22.5 \pm 0.9$ (4)	$0.9827 \pm 0.0009$	0.9794			
3	349.9	87.5	0.37	43.7	17.0	59.9	$22.5 \pm 0.4$ (4)	$0.9827 \pm 0.0005$	0.9794			
4	332.2	83.0	0.596	35.2	13.0	66.6	28.3 ± 0.3 (5)*	$0.9882 \pm 0.0003*$	0.9860*	8.67		
5	415.5	103.9	1.38	46.3	20.7	66.7	22.9 (2)	0.9831	0.9799			
6	361.6	90.4	1.45	84.7	19.9	61.6	$29.0 \pm 0.6 \ (5)^*$	$0.9889 \pm 0.0006 *$	0.9868*	8.73		
7	359.3	89.8	1.28	41.6	14.0	70.4	$28.4 \pm 0.1 \ (4)^*$	$0.9884 \pm 0.0001*$	0.9861*	8.68		
8	353.1	88.3	1.44	41.3	19.4	72.5	23.3 ± 0.7 (8)	$0.9835 \pm 0.0006$	0.9803			
9	191.9	48.0	0.918	81.4	29.0	67.4	22.7 ± 1.5 (3)	$0.9829 \pm 0.0015$	0.9796			
10	327.6	81.9	1.06	141.7	24.0	76.1	$25.5 \pm 0.2$ (6)	$0.9856 \pm 0.0004$	0.9828			
11	338.4	84.6	1.75	108.8	36.5	67.1	$23.5 \pm 0.4$ (5)	$0.9837 \pm 0.0004$	0.9806			
Average 2-	-11	-	-	-	-	$68.1 \pm 5.0 \text{ (SD)}$	23.3±1.1 (SD)	$0.983 \pm 0.001$	$0.980 \pm 0.001$ (SD)	1		
12	361.6	90.4	1.35	165.2	15.8	61.7	$25.2 \pm 0.4$ (4)	-	_	8.39		
13	375.7	93.9	1.08	71.3	21.7	61.6	$25.4 \pm 0.4$ (5)	-	-	8.40		
14	369.8	92.4	3.90	79.5	9.68	50.2	$24.4 \pm 0.7$ (5)	-	-	8.28		
15	369.2	92.3	1.68	60.9	12.2	86.2	$23.7 \pm 0.4$ (5)	-	_	8.18		
16	362.3	90.5	1.50	56.5	17.2	117.5	$24.0 \pm 0.2$ (4)	-	-	8.22		
Average	348.1	$87.0 \pm$	$1.37 \pm$	$73.3 \pm$	18.7 ±	70.5	_	_	_	-		
		12	0.8	39	7.2	70.5	-	_	-	-		

\*Data were not included in calculation of average  $d^{1}B$  and a.

<sup>†</sup>Data in parenthesis are the number of repetitive analyses.



**Figure 2.** Calculated  $d^{1}B_{4}$  vs isotopic fractionation factor  $a_{43}$  ranging from 0.95 to 1 for Sanya Bay sea water with pH of 8.12.

$$\mathbf{d}^{1}\mathbf{B}_{4} = (\mathbf{d}^{1}\mathbf{B}_{sw} + f_{3}*1000 - f_{3}*1000/\mathbf{a}_{43})/(f_{4} + f_{3}/\mathbf{a}_{43}).$$
(2)

Here  $f_3$  and  $f_4$  are molar fractions of B(OH)<sub>3</sub> and B(OH)<sub>4</sub> respectively, as decided by pH value of sea water shown in Figure 3 *a*. The **d**<sup>1</sup>B<sub>sw</sub>,  $f_3$  and  $f_4$  are 40.5‰, 0.8368 and 0.1632 respectively, for Sanya Bay sea water with pH 8.12. The calculated **d**<sup>1</sup>B<sub>4</sub> values corresponding to **a**<sub>43</sub> of 0.950 to 1, range from -3.4 to 40.5‰. An isotopic fractionation curve can be derived based on the relationship between calculated **d**<sup>1</sup>B<sub>4</sub> and **a**<sub>43</sub> as follows from Figure 2:

$$\boldsymbol{a}_{43} = 0.001139 \times \boldsymbol{d}^{11} \mathbf{B}_4 + 0.9538. \tag{3}$$

It is assumed that only the charged borate species is incorporated into carbonate minerals in corals and this incorporation occurs with a small and nearly constant isotopic fractionation. Therefore, the  $d^{1}B_{c}$  values in corals equal the  $d^{1}B_{4}$  value of sea water. The  $a_{43}$  values between two species of boron for individual growing corals in Sanya Bay were calculated using eq. (3) and are shown in Table 2. The  $\mathbf{a}_{43}$  ranges from 0.979 to 0.983 with an average of  $0.980 \pm 0.001$  (SD) for group I and from 0.986 to 0.987 with an average of 0.986 for group II. The average  $\boldsymbol{a}_{43}$  of 0.980 ± 0.001 observed is closer to the theoretical value of 0.981 reported by Kakihana et al.<sup>6</sup>, but is lower than the measured average  $\mathbf{a}_{cs}$  of 0.983 between coral and sea water. This is perhaps an actual isotopic fractionation of boron occurring between  $B(OH)_4^-$  and  $B(OH)_3$  in sea water. The pH values of sea water from which the corals SSC-1, SSC-2, SKLC, CKLC and NKLC were collected are calculated using  $d^{1}B_{sw}$  of 40.5‰ and  $a_{43}$  of 0.980 as shown below<sup>16</sup>:

$$pH = 8.83 - \log\{(\mathbf{d}^{11}B_{sw} - \mathbf{d}^{11}B_4) / [\mathbf{a}_{43}^{-1}\mathbf{d}^{11}B_4 - \mathbf{d}^{11}B_{sw} + 1000(\mathbf{a}_{43}^{-1} - 1)]\}.$$
(4)

The pH values calculated based on the measured  $d^{1}B_{c}$  are shown in Table 2. The pH value of sea water in Southern China Sea is 8.40, which is slightly higher than that of sea water in Sanya Bay, but falls into a typical pH range of sea water<sup>5</sup>, 7.5–8.4. The pH values of sea water in Kavaratti lagoon are 8.28, 8.18 and 8.22 with an average

### **RESEARCH ARTICLES**

value of 8.23, which is closer to the present sea water pH value<sup>17</sup> of 8.2. The  $\mathbf{d}^{1}$ B values of B(OH)<sub>3</sub> and B(OH)<sub>4</sub>, the two dominant aqueous species of boron in Sanya sea water as a function of pH, calculated from the fractionation factor  $\mathbf{a}_{43}$  of 0.980 obtained in this study (solid line) and from the fractionation factor  $\mathbf{a}_{43}$  of 0.980 obtained in this study (solid line) and from the fractionation factor  $\mathbf{a}_{43}$  of 0.981 (broken line)<sup>6</sup>, as well as the measured  $\mathbf{d}^{11}$ B<sub>sw</sub> value of sea water and  $\mathbf{d}^{11}$ B<sub>c</sub> of growing corals are shown in Figure 3*b*. The  $\mathbf{d}^{11}$ B<sub>3</sub> and  $\mathbf{d}^{11}$ B<sub>4</sub> at pH 8.12 are 43.8 and 23.3‰ for  $\mathbf{a}_{43}$  of 0.980. The  $\mathbf{d}^{11}$ B<sub>4</sub> were calculated as follows:

and

(5)

(6)

 $\mathbf{d}^{1}\mathbf{B}_{4} = \mathbf{d}^{1}\mathbf{B}_{3} \times 0.980 - 20.$ 

 $\mathbf{d}^{1}\mathbf{B}_{3} = (40.5 + 20 \times f_{4})/(0.980 \times f_{4} + f_{3}),$ 

Here  $f_3 = 0.8368$  and  $f_4 = 0.1632$  based on Figure 3 *a*. The results of Figure 3 *b* indicate that the  $d^{11}B_c$  values of SYC-3, 5 and 6 are much higher than  $d^{11}B_4$  of 23.3‰,



**Figure 3.** *a*, Distribution of aqueous boron species vs pH calculated using pK (dissociation constant of boric acid) value of 8.83 (Hershey *et al.*<sup>26</sup>). *b*,  $d^{1}B$  values of B(OH)<sub>3</sub> and B(OH)<sub>4</sub>, two dominant aqueous species of boron in Sanya sea water, as a function of pH calculated from isotopic fractionation factor of 0.980 obtained in this study (solid line) and from the fractionation factor of 0.981 reported by Kakihana<sup>6</sup> (broken line). Measured  $d^{1}B$  value of sea water and growing corals are shown.  $d^{1}B_{3}$  and  $d^{1}B_{4}$  at pH 8.12 are 43.8 and 23.3‰ respectively for isotopic fractionation factor of 0.980.

i.e. average value for SYC-1, 2, 4, 7-10. This could be due to the following: (1) The sea water surrounding the corals have a distinctly higher  $d^{1}B_{sw}$ . In case the pH and  $a_{43}$  are constant and only the charged borate species is incorporated into the corals, the  $d^{11}B_{sw}$  of sea water surrounding SYC-3, 5 and 6 can be calculated to be 46.2, 46.9 and 46.3% respectively, which is much higher than the measured  $d^{1}B_{sw}$  of 40.5‰ and exceeds the  $d^{1}B_{sw}$  variation range<sup>20</sup> of 38.4 to 44.4‰. Such high  $d^{1}B_{sw}$  values are unlikely to occur in Sanya Bay. (2) The microenvironment of the coral cell has a distinctive pH. Microsensor studies of the living symbiotic species Globigerinoides trilobus and related taxa show that pH increases over short distances as the foraminifer shell is approached  $^{21,22}$ . This condition perhaps is present for the growing corals. The pH value of sea water surrounding SYC-3, 5 and 6 is calculated to be 8.67, 8.83 and 8.68 respectively only if charged borate species is incorporated into the corals and  $a_{43}$  is 0.980 and the  $d^{1}B_{sw}$  is 40.5%. Comparing this with measured pH value of 8.12, the occurrence of large fluctuations in pH in the crystallizing environment is also unlikely. (3) A smaller isotopic fractionation between  $d^{1}B_{3}$  and  $d^{1}B_{4}$ occurs. The calculated  $a_{43}$  values are 0.9860 0.987 and 0.986 with an average of 0.986 (Table 2). The highest isotopic fractionation,  $a_{43}$  of 0.984, was reported by Hemming *et al.*<sup>8</sup>. The  $a_{43}$  of 0.986 may not be accepted. (4)  $B(OH)_3$  and  $B(OH)_4^-$  are incorporated into corals simultaneously. Most of the studies on boron isotopes suggest that only  $B(OH)_4^-$  anion is incorporated into the marine carbonate<sup>5,19</sup>. Here, a mechanism for incorporating a substantial amount of the heavier B(OH)3 species must be invoked. The adsorption of boron species onto the mineral surfaces indicated that for pH values below 9.24, B(OH)<sub>3</sub> may be preferentially adsorbed onto the mineral surface. When the solution pH exceeds 9.24,  $B(OH)_4^-$  becomes dominant and may be preferentially adsorbed<sup>23</sup>. In the case of sea water pH of 8.12 in Sanya Bay, it is possible that a substantial amount of B(OH)<sub>3</sub> incorporates into the coral cell. Based on the measured  $d^{1}B_{c}$ , the calculated  $d^{1}B_{3}$  and  $d^{1}B_{4}$  are shown in Figure 3 b. The fractions of  $B(OH)_3$  in coral cell can be calculated to be 0.2439, 0.2780 and 0.2488 for SYC-3, 5 and 6 respectively. This application is vital to the use of  $d^{1}B_{c}$  values of biological carbonate from the ocean in reconstructing the past ocean pH. The incorporation of B(OH)<sub>3</sub> into biological carbonate in the ocean suggests that it is not possible to apply the  $d^{1}B_{c}$ value of biological carbonate in the ocean to calculate oceanic pH. At present, we cannot rule out the factors causing an incorporation of B(OH)3 into biological carbonates in the ocean.

## Application of isotopic fractionation factor for the calculation of pH value of sea water

It is important to apply an actual  $a_{43}$  for calculation of pH value of sea water based on the measured  $d^{11}B_c$  value. In

CURRENT SCIENCE, VOL. 90, NO. 3, 10 FEBRUARY 2006

the typical pH range of sea water<sup>8</sup>, 7.5–8.4, the calculated  $\mathbf{d}^{1}B_{4}$  of sea water vs the  $\mathbf{a}_{43}$ , ranging from 0.95 to 1 is shown in Figure 4. The results suggest that  $\mathbf{d}^{1}B_{4}$  increases with increase in  $\mathbf{a}_{43}$  and reaches the  $\mathbf{d}^{1}B_{sw}$  when  $\mathbf{a}_{43}$  is 1, based on the eq. (2). Similarly, at a typical pH range of sea water, 7.5–8.4, using the  $\mathbf{d}^{1}B_{sw}$  of 39.8‰, the ranges of variation for the measured  $\mathbf{d}^{1}B_{c}$  values would be from 8.6 to 16.0‰, 20.9 to 25.5‰, 21.5 to 25.9‰ and 24.6 to 28.3‰, when  $\mathbf{a}_{43}$  has values of 0.968, 0.980, 0.981 and 0.984 respectively. Moreover, the maximum variation ranges of  $\mathbf{d}^{1}B_{4}$  are 6.5–39.8‰, 19.3–39.8‰, 20.0–39.8‰ and 23.2–39.8‰ for  $\mathbf{a}_{34} = 0.968$ , 0.9803, 0.981 and 0.984 respectively. The measured  $\mathbf{d}^{1}B_{c}$  values falling into the normal variations ranges are used to calculate the pH of sea water. The measured  $\mathbf{d}^{1}B_{c}$  values exceeding the maxi-



**Figure 4.** Calculated  $d^{1}B_{4}$  for sea water with pH ranging from 7.5 to 8.4 vs isotopic fractionation factor  $a_{43}$  ranging from 0.95 to 1 vs.



**Figure 5.** Comparison of calculated pH values based on published  $\mathbf{d}^{1}B_{c}$  of marine biogenic carbonates (line 1,  $\mathbf{d}^{1}B_{c}$  values from 10.5 to 32.2‰) using  $\mathbf{a}_{43} = 0.968$  (n = 187, average pH = 8.85). Line 2,  $\mathbf{a}_{43} = 0.980$  (n = 173, average pH = 8.23). Line 3, Obtained in this study;  $\mathbf{a}_{43} = 0.981$  (n = 167, average pH = 8.17). Line 4,  $\mathbf{a}_{43} = 0.984$  (n = 115, average pH = 7.76) (line 5).

CURRENT SCIENCE, VOL. 90, NO. 3, 10 FEBRUARY 2006

mum variations ranges cannot be used to calculate the pH values. Using published  $\mathbf{a}_{43}$  of 0.968 (ref. 7), 0.981 (ref. 6), 0.984 (ref. 8) and 0.980 observed in this study, we recalculate the pH values of sea water based on the published  $d^{1}B_{c}$  values of marine biological carbonates<sup>5,10-1/2,17-19,24,25</sup> (total n = 189, Figure 5, line 1). The re-calculated pH values show the average values of  $8.85 \pm 0.18$  (n = 187, only two measured  $d^{1}B_{c}$  values are lower than 6.5‰),  $8.23 \pm 0.37$  (n = 173, 16 measured **d**<sup>1</sup>B<sub>c</sub> values are lower than 19.3‰),  $8.17 \pm 0.40$  (*n* = 167, 21 measured **d**<sup>1</sup>B<sub>c</sub> values are lower than 20.0‰),  $7.76 \pm 0.54$  (*n* = 115, 74 measured  $d^{1}B_{c}$  values are lower than 23.2‰) and when  $a_{43} = 0.968, 0.980, 0.981, 0.984$  respectively. The results imply that  $a_{43}$  values of 0.968 and 0.984 are not suited to calculate pH value because the re-calculated pH values of 8.85 and 7.76 are either too high for using  $a_{43} = 0.968$  or too low for using  $a_{43} = 0.984$  respectively, when compared with the pH of modern sea water. The re-calculated pH values of 8.22 and 8.17 using measured  $a_{43}$  of 0.980 in this study and  $a_{43}$  of 0.981 given by Kakihana *et al.*<sup>6</sup>, are close to the pH of 8.2 for modern sea water. Our measured  $\mathbf{a}_{43}$  of 0.980 strongly demonstrates itself the  $\mathbf{a}_{43}$ value of 0.981 reported by Kakihana et al.6 and therefore can be used as a standard  $\mathbf{a}_{43}$  value for calculating the past oceanic pH values.

### Conclusion

The isotopic fractionation of boron that takes place during the uptake of boron from sea water for its incorporation into the carbonate structure of growing corals indicates that the fractionation is different in different species of corals. The relatively higher  $d^{1}B_{c}$  values observed in different species of corals indicate an additional amount of trigonal species of boron to be incorporated into the coral cell. The fractionation factor can be used for measuring the pH of sea water in which the coral was growing and has an implication in palaeo-pH measurements of sea water or the oceans. The fractionation factor  $(a_{43})$  observed in the present study, which is 0.980, is nearly the same as 0.981 – one of the best fractionation factors proposed by by Kakihana et al.6. The pH values of sea water recalculated using the two  $a_{43}$  values (0.981 and 0.980), gave pH values close to those of modern sea water compared with the other published  $a_{43}$  values, as they give either high or low pH values for modern sea water. The measured  $a_{43}$  of 0.980 in the present study can therefore be considered as a standard  $\boldsymbol{a}_{43}$  value for palaeo-pH measurements.

Sanyal, A., Hemming, N. G., Broecker, W. S. and Hanson, G. N., Changes in pH in the eastern equatorial Pacific across stage 5–6 boundary based on boron isotopes in foraminifer. *Global Biogeochem. Cycle*, 1997, **11**, 125–133.

Sanyal, A., Nugent, M., Reeder, R. J. and Buma, J., Sea water pH control on the boron isotopic composition of calcite: Evidence from inorganic calcite precipitation experiments. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 2000, 64, 1551–1555.

### **RESEARCH ARTICLES**

- Spivack, A. J. and Edmond, J. M., Boron isotope exchange between sea water and the oceanic crust. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 1987, **51**, 1033–1043.
- Spivack, A. J., Palmer, M. R. and Edmond, J. M., The sedimentary cycle of the boron isotopes. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 1987, 51, 1939–1949.
- Hemming, N. G. and Hanson, G. N., Boron isotopic composition and concentration in modern marine carbonates. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 1992, 56, 537–543.
- Kakihana, H. *et al.*, Fundamental studies on the ion exchange separation of boron isotopes. *Bull. Chem. Jpn.*, 1977, 50, 158–163.
- Palmer, M. R., Spivack, A. J. and Edmond, J. M., Temperature and pH controls over isotopic fractionation during absorption of boron marine clay. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 1987, **51**, 2319– 2323.
- Hemming, N. G., Reeder, R. J. and Hanson, G. N., Mineral-fluid partitioning and isotopic fractionation of boron in synthetic calcium carbonate. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 1995, **59**, 371–379.
- Lécuyer, C., Grandjean, P., Reynard, B., Albaréde, F. and Telouk, P., <sup>11</sup>B/<sup>10</sup>B analysis of geological materials by ICP-MS plasma 54: Application to the boron fractionation between brachiopod calcite and sea water. *Chem. Geol.*, 2002, **186**, 45–55.
- Sanyal, A., Hemming, N. G., Hanson, G. N. and Broecker, W. S., Evidence for a high pH in the glacial ocean from boron isotopes in foraminifera. *Nature*, 1995, **373**, 234–236.
- Pearson, P. N. and Palmer, M. R., Atmospheric carbon dioxide concentrations over the past 60 million years. *Science*, 2000, 406, 695–699.
- Spivack, A. J., You, C. F. and Smith, J., Foraminiferal boron isotopic ratios as a proxy for surface ocean pH over the past 21 Myr. *Nature*, 1993, 363, 149–151.
- Xiao, Y. K., Liao, B. Y., Liu, W. G., Xiao, Y. and Swihart, G. H., Ion exchange extraction of boron from aqueous fluids by Amberlite IRA 743 resin. *Chin. J. Chem.*, 2003, **21**, 1073–1079.
- Wang, Q., Xiao, Y. K., Wang, Y. H., Zhang, C. G. and Wei, H. Z., Boron separation by the two-step ion-exchange for the isotopic measurement of boron. *Chin. J. Chem.*, 2002, **20**, 45–50.
- Xiao, Y. K., Beary, E. S. and Fassett, J. D., An improved method for the high precision isotopic measurement of boron by thermal ionization mass spectrometry. *Int. J. Mass Spectrom. Ion Proc.*, 1988, 85, 203–213.
- 16. Xiao, Y. K., Swihart, G. H., Xiao, Y. and Vocke, R. D., A preliminary experimental study of the boron concentration in vapor

and the isotopic fractionation of boron between sea water and vapor during evaporation of sea water. *Sci. China* (*Ser. B*), 2001, 44, 540–551.

- Gaillardet, J. and Allègre, C. J., Boron isotopic compositions of coral: Sea water or diagenesis record? *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 1995, 136, 665–676.
- Liu, W. G., Peng, Z. C., Xiao, Y. K., Wang, Z. R., Nie, B. F. and An, Z. S., Boron isotopic composition of corals from South China Sea and their environmental significance. *Geochimia*, 1999, 28, 534–541(in Chinese).
- Vengosh, A., Kolodny, Y., Starinsky, A., Chivas, A. R. and McCulloch, M. T., Co-precipitation and isotopic fractionation of boron in modern biogenic carbonates. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 1991, 55, 2901–2910.
- Barth, S., Boron isotope variations in nature: a synthesis. Geo. Rundch, 1993, 82, 640–651.
- Jorgensen, B. B., Erez, J. and Revsbech, N. P., Symbiotic photosynthesis in a planktonic foraminiferan, *Globigerinoides sacculifer* (Brady) studied with microelectrodes, *Limnol. Oceanogr.*, 1985, 30, 1253–1267.
- Rink, S., Kühl, M., Bijma, J. and Spero, H. J., Microsensor studies of photosynthesis and respiration in the symbiotic foraminifer *Orbulina universa. Mar. Biol.*, 1998, **131**, 583–595.
- Hobbs, M. Y. and Reardon, E. J., Effect of pH on boron co-precipitation by calcite: Further evidence for non equilibrium partitioning of trace elements. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 1999, 63, 1013–1021.
- Pearson, P. N. and Palmer, M. R., Middle Eocene sea water pH and atmospheric carbon dioxide concentration. *Science*, 1999, 284, 1824–1826.
- Palmer, M. R., Pearson, P. N. and Cobb, S. J., Reconstructing past ocean pH-depth profiles. *Science*, 1998, 282, 1468–1471.
- Hershey, J. P., Fernandez, M., Milne, P. J. and Millero, F. J., The ionization of boric acid in NaCl, Na-Ca-Cl and Na-Mg-Cl solutions at 25. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 1986, **50**, 143–148.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS. We thank Dr Sun Weidong for providing coral samples. This project was supported by National Nature Foundation of China and State Key Laboratory of Loess and Quaternary Geology, Institute of Earth Environment, Chinese Academy of Sciences.

Received 16 November 2004; revised accepted 18 November 2005